DeFi: opportunities and challenges

Leonardo Gambacorta*

Head of Innovation and the Digital Economy, Bank for International Settlements ECB/EC virtual conference "An EU financial system for the future", 6 April 2022

*The views expressed here are mine and not necessarily those of the Bank for International Settlements

Decentralisation in digital finance: possibilities and limits

- DLT and smart contracts could improve the efficiency of the monetary and financial system
- At the same time, we need to preserve safety and integrity
- DeFi: decentralisation and anonymity
- As it stands now the DeFi system has some problems and could introduce serious risks
 - Limited network effects
 - Prone to congestions
 - Validators extract high rents

Network effects and "winner takes all" does not hold for DeFi; instead increasing fragmentation of blockchain platforms point to lack of scalability



Sources: F Boissay, G Cornelli, S Doerr and J Frost, "Decentralised finance: more monies, more problems", BIS Bulletins, forthcoming

Higher gas fees are one symptom of scalability problem, but cutting corners on security cannot be the answer (eg, recent DeFi theft through hacks)



Sources: F Boissay, G Cornelli, S Doerr and J Frost, "Decentralised finance: more monies, more problems", BIS Bulletins, forthcoming; Etherscan.

Rise of alternative chains has coincided with rising gas fees, raising question of whether fragmentation is inevitable consequence of Buterin's "Trilemma"



Sources: F Boissay, G Cornelli, S Doerr and J Frost, "Decentralised finance: more monies, more problems", BIS Bulletins, forthcoming; DeFi Llama; Etherscan; CoinGecko.

Buterin's trilemma



In stark contrast, good payment platforms harness network effects to scale; since its launch in Nov 2020, Brazil's Pix has signed up 67% of adult population



Pix transaction value (rhs)

• 123.1 million users

- 114 million individuals (67% of Brazil's adult population)
- **9.1** million companies (**60%** of companies with relationship in the National Financial System)
- Of the **114** million individuals, **50** million of Pix users did not use bank transfers before Pix was launched

Source: A Duarte, J Frost, L Gambacorta, P Koo Wilkens and H S Shin, "Central banks, the monetary system and public payment infrastructures: lessons from Brazil's Pix", BIS Bulletins, no 52, March 2022.

In little over a year, Pix is poised to overtake credit and debt cards, slashing costs for users and merchants



Source: A Duarte, J Frost, L Gambacorta, P Koo Wilkens and H S Shin, "Central banks, the monetary system and public payment infrastructures: lessons from Brazil's Pix", BIS Bulletins, no 52, March 2022.

That said, crypto also benefits from network effects through speculative buying of coins; high correlation of coin prices across blockchains are a countervailing force against lack of scalability of the underlying chains



Pairwise correlation

Sources: F Boissay, G Cornelli, S Doerr and J Frost, "Decentralised finance: more monies, more problems", BIS Bulletins, forthcoming; DeFi Llama; CoinGecko.

Institutional investors now play a large role in crypto markets



Sources: R Auer, M Farag, U Lewrick, L Orazem and M Zoss (2022), "Banking in the shadow of Bitcoin? The institutional adoption of cryptocurrencies", BIS papers, forthcoming; Coinbase.

To what extent is DeFi sustained only by inflows of new holders of coins in crypto markets?



Sources: @richardchen39, Dune Analytics; CoinGecko; Defi Llama; authors' calculations..

How decentralised is DeFi? Insiders with high coin allocation exert control and collect rents



Validators in the chain can extract "miner extractable value" (MEV)

- MEV is a measure of the profit a miner/validator can make through their ability to include, exclude or re-order transactions within the blocks they add to the blockchain
- **Example:** a validator spots an arbitrage opportunity on a DeFi exchange and submits a transaction to capture this opportunity; instead of processing the transaction, the validator front-runs the trade by including his own trade in the block



Conclusions

- DeFi offers a range of new financial applications, as part of a broader vision called "Web3"
- But DeFi is not delivering this in practice:
 - DeFi must incentivise validators through high fees; power in the hands of few
 - Blockchain applications do not scale, as they cannot harness the network effects
 - DeFi and automated smart contracts do not fully replace for trust
- To fully benefit from technological advances, we urgently need regulation of cryptoassets, stablecoins and DeFi to address relevant risks